

from C. Leroy Ellenberger

Dear Dr. Mock,

I am a long-time student of the Velikovsky controversy and earlier this week I was sent the URL below to your 2009 posting, which was new to me:

"Leroy, if you haven't seen the below link, take a glance.
Amazing, religious cite with V as "Moses"

<http://www.biblesearchers.com/prophecy/planetx/losttribes2.shtml#QuestGod> "

You obviously have a strong affinity for Velikovsky's celebrated claims, which affinity, alas, is not accompanied with any meaningful proof that Velikovsky is correct. You cite no model-specific physical evidence ON EARTH proving that Worlds in Collision really happened. Where, for instance, is all the red debris Venus supposedly dumped on Earth at the time of the Exodus that caused forty (or however many) years of darkness? There is NO SIGN of it anywhere on Earth. Not in the polar ice caps or other glacial preserves scattered across the Earth, not on the ocean floors (the white Worzel ash in the Pacific off the coast of South America is NOT global and is volcanic to the exclusion of any other origin), and not even in the Sea of Galilee. If this does not count as a refutation of Velikovsky's scenario, what would?

As Velikovsky might do were he alive to counsel you, he would exhort you to read the Wikipedia entries for "Worlds in Collision" and "Immanuel Velikovsky" which contain many links to critical sources that hopefully would disabuse you of your Velikovskian delusions, as my 1995 article in Skeptic 3(4), "An Antidote to Velikovskian Delusions", was intended to do whose expanded version may be read at <http://abob.libs.uga.edu/bobk/velidelu.html> . You might also wish to read the recent book by Princeton historian Michael Gordin, "The Pseudoscience Wars: Immanuel Velikovsky and the Birth of the Modern Fringe" along with the four reviews and many comments at amazon.com. The book has received rave reviews in Science, Nature, London Review of Books, and several on-line publications such as WSJ and TNR. My "Top Ten Reasons Why Velikovsky

Is Wrong About Worlds in Collision" would also be instructive:
<http://abob.libs.uga.edu/bobk/vdtop1en.html> , as would my 1996 review of
the Velikovsky biography ABA by his daughter Ruth V. Sharon:
<http://abob.libs.uga.edu/bobk/cle/cle-jose.txt> , esp. for the sections
"Velikovsky versus Clube" and "The Ginenthal Factor."

Sincerely,

C. Leroy Ellenberger

http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/C._Leroy_Ellenberger

St. Louis, Missouri